# ECE 598 Computational Power Systems

# Inverse optimization for market analytics

Vladimir Dvorkin

University of Michigan

#### Last lecture recap

- Look around you and form teams of 2 people (1 min)
- Quickly review your notes or the slide deck (1 min)
- Share your three personal highlights with your partner (3 min)
- Get iClicker app ready

# Inversing ISO's decision-making model



## Inversing ISO's decision-making model



In practice, we do not know optimization underlying the decision-making process
 But we know some data (e.g., weather) and decisions (e.g., dispatch, prices)
 Our goal is to estimate *y* from decisions *x*, *λ* to reconstruct decision-making

# Where does the data come from?



https://www.gridstatus.io/live



app.electricitymaps.com

- Abundance of data available in real-time thanks to grid analytics start ups
- Aggregated generation statistics, LMPs, emissions, meteorological data, etc.
- We can rely on these data points to restore the underlying ISO's decision-making

# Taxonomy of inverse optimization (IO) problems



- Forward optimization: the decision-making model whose parameters we intend to estimate from the optimal decisions
- **Unkown**: parameters of the objective function, constraint function, or both
- Fitting: Depending on available data, we may achieve the perfect fit or, at least, maximize a suitable measure of fitness

# Taxonomy of inverse optimization (IO) problems



- **Forward optimization**: the decision-making model whose parameters we intend to estimate from the optimal decisions
- **Unkown**: parameters of the objective function, constraint function, or both
- Fitting: Depending on available data, we may achieve the perfect fit or, at least, maximize a suitable measure of fitness

# Forward optimization (FO) problem

Original optimization problem

Forward optimization problem

- $\begin{array}{ll} \underset{x}{\text{minimize}} & x^{\top} \mathbf{C} x + \mathbf{c}^{\top} x & \underset{x}{\text{minimize}} & x^{\top} \Theta x + \theta^{\top} x \\ \text{subject to} & \mathbf{A} x \geqslant \mathbf{b} & \text{subject to} & \mathbf{\Psi} x \geqslant \psi \end{array}$
- FO replicates the structure of the original problem
   Θ and θ are unknown parameters of the objective function
   Ψ and ψ are unknown parameters of the constraint function

## Forward optimization (FO) problem

Original optimization problem

Forward optimization problem

- $\begin{array}{ll} \underset{x}{\text{minimize}} & x^{\top} \mathbf{C} x + \mathbf{c}^{\top} x & \underset{x}{\text{minimize}} & x^{\top} \mathbf{\Theta} x + \boldsymbol{\theta}^{\top} x \\ \text{subject to} & \mathbf{A} x \geqslant \mathbf{b} & \text{subject to } & \Psi x \geqslant \psi \end{array}$
- FO replicates the structure of the original problem
  Θ and θ are unknown parameters of the objective function
  Ψ and ψ are unknown parameters of the constraint function
- **Estimating objective function**: set  $\Psi = A$  and  $\psi = b$ , estimate  $\Theta$  and  $\theta$
- **Estimating constraint function**: set  $\Theta = C$  and  $\theta = c$ , estimate  $\Psi$  and  $\psi$

- $\blacksquare$  Second-order cost coefficients in  ${\bf C}$  and constraint matrix  ${\bf A}$  are known
- $\blacksquare$  First-order cost coefficients in  ${\bf c}$  and the right-hand side parameter  ${\bf b}$  are unknown
- **E** Known optimal primal and dual decisions  $\mathbf{x}^{\star}$  and  $\boldsymbol{\lambda}^{\star}$  from the original problem

- Second-order cost coefficients in C and constraint matrix A are known
- First-order cost coefficients in **c** and the right-hand side parameter **b** are unknown
- $\blacksquare$  Known optimal primal and dual decisions x\* and  $\lambda^{\star}$  from the original problem

$$\begin{array}{ll} \underset{\theta,\psi}{\text{minimize}} & \underbrace{\|\mathbf{x}(\theta,\psi) - \mathbf{x}^{\star}\|_{p}}_{\text{primal error}} + \underbrace{\|\lambda(\theta,\psi) - \lambda^{\star}\|_{p}}_{\text{dual error}} & \text{minimize decision error} \\ \\ \underset{\psi}{\text{subject to}} & \underline{\theta} \leqslant \overline{\theta} & \text{constrain unknowns} \\ \\ \underbrace{\psi} \leqslant \psi \leqslant \overline{\psi} & \\ \\ \mathbf{x}(\theta,\psi) \cup \lambda(\theta,\psi) \in \underset{\mathbf{x},\lambda}{\operatorname{argmin}} & \mathbf{x}^{\top}\mathbf{C}\mathbf{x} + \theta^{\top}\mathbf{x} \\ \\ \underset{x,\lambda}{\text{feedback from FO}} & \text{subject to} & \mathbf{A}\mathbf{x} \ge \psi : \lambda \end{array}$$

Second-order cost coefficients in C and constraint matrix A are known

First-order cost coefficients in **c** and the right-hand side parameter **b** are unknown

**E** Known optimal primal and dual decisions  $\mathbf{x}^*$  and  $\boldsymbol{\lambda}^*$  from the original problem

$$\begin{array}{ll} \underset{\theta,\psi}{\text{minimize}} & \underbrace{\|\mathbf{x}(\theta,\psi) - \mathbf{x}^{\star}\|_{p}}_{\text{primal error}} + \underbrace{\|\lambda(\theta,\psi) - \lambda^{\star}\|_{p}}_{\text{dual error}} & \text{minimize decision error} \\ \\ \underset{\psi}{\text{subject to}} & \underline{\theta} \leqslant \theta \leqslant \overline{\theta} & \text{constrain unknowns} \\ \\ \underbrace{\psi} \leqslant \psi \leqslant \overline{\psi} & \\ \\ \mathbf{x}(\theta,\psi) \cup \lambda(\theta,\psi) \in \underset{\mathbf{x},\lambda}{\operatorname{argmin}} & \mathbf{x}^{\top}\mathbf{C}\mathbf{x} + \theta^{\top}\mathbf{x} \\ \\ \\ \underset{x \in \lambda}{\text{subject to}} & \mathbf{A}\mathbf{x} \geqslant \psi : \lambda \end{array}$$

**Q.** How to solve this problem?

- Second-order cost coefficients in C and constraint matrix A are known
- First-order cost coefficients in **c** and the right-hand side parameter **b** are unknown
- **E** Known optimal primal and dual decisions  $\mathbf{x}^*$  and  $\boldsymbol{\lambda}^*$  from the original problem

$$\begin{array}{ll} \underset{\theta,\psi}{\text{minimize}} & \underbrace{\|\mathbf{x}(\theta,\psi) - \mathbf{x}^{\star}\|_{p}}_{\text{primal error}} + \underbrace{\|\lambda(\theta,\psi) - \lambda^{\star}\|_{p}}_{\text{dual error}} & \text{minimize decision error} \\ \\ \underset{\psi}{\text{subject to}} & \underline{\theta} \leqslant \overline{\theta} & \text{constrain unknowns} \\ \\ \underbrace{\psi} \leqslant \psi \leqslant \overline{\psi} & \\ \\ \mathbf{x}(\theta,\psi) \cup \lambda(\theta,\psi) \in \underset{\mathbf{x},\lambda}{\operatorname{argmin}} & \mathbf{x}^{\top}\mathbf{C}\mathbf{x} + \theta^{\top}\mathbf{x} \\ \\ \underset{x,\lambda}{\text{feedback from FO}} & \text{subject to} & \mathbf{A}\mathbf{x} \geqslant \psi : \lambda \end{array}$$

- **Q.** How to solve this problem?
- For  $p = \{1, \infty\}$ , solve the IO as mixed-integer linear program in a single shot
- For p = 2, we can also iteratively solve the IO using gradient descent
- See Lecture 10 for solution strategies

In classic IO, we only relied on a single observation x\* and λ\*
Data-driven IO acts on the history of n observations

 $(\mathbf{x}_i^{\star}, \boldsymbol{\lambda}_i^{\star}), \dots, (\mathbf{x}_n^{\star}, \boldsymbol{\lambda}_n^{\star})$ 

Used to estimate static parameters (e.g., c, b) from repeated observations
 or *data generating* models (e.g., forecast models) that produce decision inputs

### Data-driven IO for static parameter estimation

Given a history of *n* observations (x<sup>\*</sup><sub>i</sub>, λ<sup>\*</sup><sub>i</sub>), find the right-hand side parameter b
 Optimized unknown parameter ψ on all *n* observations

$$\begin{array}{ll} \underset{\psi}{\text{minimize}} & \frac{1}{2}\sum_{i=1}^{n} \left( \left\| \mathbf{x}_{i}(\psi) - \mathbf{x}_{i}^{\star} \right\|_{p} + \left\| \lambda_{i}(\psi) - \lambda_{i}^{\star} \right\|_{p} \right) & \text{minimize decision error} \\ \text{subject to} & \frac{\psi}{\psi} \leqslant \psi \leqslant \overline{\psi} \\ & \mathbf{x}_{i}(\psi) \cup \lambda_{i}(\psi) \in \underset{\mathbf{x},\lambda}{\operatorname{argmin}} & \mathbf{x}^{\top} \mathbf{C}_{i} \mathbf{x} + \mathbf{c}_{i}^{\top} \mathbf{x} \\ & \text{subject to} & \mathbf{A}_{i} \mathbf{x} \geqslant \psi : \lambda \end{array}$$

### Data-driven IO for static parameter estimation

Given a history of *n* observations (**x**<sup>\*</sup><sub>i</sub>, λ<sup>\*</sup><sub>i</sub>), find the right-hand side parameter **b** Optimized unknown parameter ψ on all *n* observations

$$\begin{array}{ll} \underset{\psi}{\text{minimize}} & \frac{1}{2}\sum_{i=1}^{n} \left( \left\| \mathbf{x}_{i}(\psi) - \mathbf{x}_{i}^{\star} \right\|_{p} + \left\| \lambda_{i}(\psi) - \lambda_{i}^{\star} \right\|_{p} \right) & \text{minimize decision error} \\ \text{subject to} & \frac{\psi}{\psi} \leqslant \psi \leqslant \overline{\psi} \\ & \mathbf{x}_{i}(\psi) \cup \lambda_{i}(\psi) \in \underset{\mathbf{x},\lambda}{\operatorname{argmin}} & \mathbf{x}^{\top} \mathbf{C}_{i} \mathbf{x} + \mathbf{c}_{i}^{\top} \mathbf{x} \\ & \text{subject to} & \mathbf{A}_{i} \mathbf{x} \geqslant \psi : \lambda \end{array}$$

**Q.** How to solve the problem when *n* is large?

Consider that the right-hand side parameter **b** is variable

Suppose it comes from a prediction model:

$$\widehat{\mathbf{b}} = \mathbf{B}\widehat{\boldsymbol{\varphi}}$$

where  $\widehat{\varphi}$  is the feature vector, and **B** is the matrix of model weights

- Feature  $\hat{\varphi}$  should correlate variable with  $\hat{\mathbf{b}}$  (e.g., as air temperature for loads)
- Given a history of observations  $\{(\mathbf{x}_i^{\star}, \boldsymbol{\lambda}_i^{\star}, \boldsymbol{\varphi}_i)\}_{i=1}^n$ , find model weights **B**

- Consider that the right-hand side parameter **b** is variable
- Suppose it comes from a prediction model:

$$\widehat{\mathbf{b}} = \mathbf{B}\widehat{\boldsymbol{\varphi}}$$

where φ̂ is the feature vector, and B is the matrix of model weights
Feature φ̂ should correlate variable with b̂ (e.g., as air temperature for loads)
Given a history of observations {(x<sub>i</sub><sup>\*</sup>, λ<sub>i</sub><sup>\*</sup>, φ<sub>i</sub>)}<sub>i=1</sub><sup>n</sup>, find model weights B

$$\begin{array}{ll} \underset{\mathbf{B}}{\text{minimize}} & \frac{1}{2}\sum_{i=1}^{n} \left( \left\| \mathbf{x}_{i}(\mathbf{B}) - \mathbf{x}_{i}^{\star} \right\|_{p} + \left\| \lambda_{i}(\mathbf{B}) - \lambda_{i}^{\star} \right\|_{p} \right) & \text{minimize decision error} \\ \\ \text{subject to} & \mathbf{x}_{i}(\mathbf{B}) \cup \lambda_{i}(\mathbf{B}) \in \underset{\mathbf{x},\lambda}{\operatorname{argmin}} & \mathbf{x}^{\top}\mathbf{C}_{i}\mathbf{x} + \mathbf{c}_{i}^{\top}\mathbf{x} & FO \text{ for every } i \\ \\ & \text{subject to} & \mathbf{A}_{i}\mathbf{x} \ge \mathbf{B}\varphi_{i} : \lambda \end{array}$$

- Consider that the right-hand side parameter **b** is variable
- Suppose it comes from a prediction model:

$$\widehat{\mathbf{b}} = \mathbf{B}\widehat{\boldsymbol{\varphi}}$$

where  $\widehat{\varphi}$  is the feature vector, and **B** is the matrix of model weights **F**eature  $\widehat{\varphi}$  should correlate variable with  $\widehat{\mathbf{b}}$  (e.g., as air temperature for loads) **G**iven a history of observations  $\{(\mathbf{x}_i^*, \boldsymbol{\lambda}_i^*, \varphi_i)\}_{i=1}^n$ , find model weights **B** 

$$\begin{array}{ll} \underset{\mathbf{B}}{\text{minimize}} & \frac{1}{2}\sum_{i=1}^{n} \left( \|\mathbf{x}_{i}(\mathbf{B}) - \mathbf{x}_{i}^{\star}\|_{p} + \|\boldsymbol{\lambda}_{i}(\mathbf{B}) - \boldsymbol{\lambda}_{i}^{\star}\|_{p} \right) & \text{minimize decision error} \\ \\ \text{subject to} & \mathbf{x}_{i}(\mathbf{B}) \cup \boldsymbol{\lambda}_{i}(\mathbf{B}) \in \underset{\mathbf{x}, \boldsymbol{\lambda}}{\operatorname{argmin}} & \mathbf{x}^{\top} \mathbf{C}_{i} \mathbf{x} + \mathbf{c}_{i}^{\top} \mathbf{x} \\ & \text{subject to} & \mathbf{A}_{i} \mathbf{x} \geqslant \mathbf{B} \boldsymbol{\varphi}_{i} : \boldsymbol{\lambda} \end{array}$$

n number of FO problems are coupled by common weights B

- Consider that the right-hand side parameter **b** is variable
- Suppose it comes from a prediction model:

$$\widehat{\mathbf{b}} = \mathbf{B}\widehat{\boldsymbol{\varphi}}$$

where  $\widehat{\varphi}$  is the feature vector, and **B** is the matrix of model weights **F**eature  $\widehat{\varphi}$  should correlate variable with  $\widehat{\mathbf{b}}$  (e.g., as air temperature for loads) **G**iven a history of observations  $\{(\mathbf{x}_i^*, \boldsymbol{\lambda}_i^*, \varphi_i)\}_{i=1}^n$ , find model weights **B** 

$$\begin{array}{ll} \underset{\mathbf{B}}{\text{minimize}} & \frac{1}{2}\sum_{i=1}^{n} \left( \|\mathbf{x}_{i}(\mathbf{B}) - \mathbf{x}_{i}^{\star}\|_{p} + \|\boldsymbol{\lambda}_{i}(\mathbf{B}) - \boldsymbol{\lambda}_{i}^{\star}\|_{p} \right) & \text{minimize decision error} \\ \\ \text{subject to} & \mathbf{x}_{i}(\mathbf{B}) \cup \boldsymbol{\lambda}_{i}(\mathbf{B}) \in \underset{\mathbf{x}, \boldsymbol{\lambda}}{\operatorname{argmin}} & \mathbf{x}^{\top} \mathbf{C}_{i} \mathbf{x} + \mathbf{c}_{i}^{\top} \mathbf{x} \\ & \text{subject to} & \mathbf{A}_{i} \mathbf{x} \ge \mathbf{B} \boldsymbol{\varphi}_{i} : \boldsymbol{\lambda} \end{array}$$

*n* number of FO problems are coupled by common weights B
 Exercise 1: derive the gradient for SGD update
 Exercise 2: derive sensitivities <sup>∂x(B)</sup>/<sub>∂B</sub> and <sup>∂λ(B)</sup>/<sub>∂B</sub>

### Application: Unveiling ISO's wind power forecast model - I

Consider an optimal power flow problem:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \underset{p}{\text{minimize}} & \mathbf{p}^{\top}\mathbf{C}\mathbf{p} + \mathbf{c}^{\top}\mathbf{p} & \text{generator dispatch cost} \\ \text{subject to} & \underline{\mathbf{p}} \leqslant \mathbf{p} \leqslant \overline{\mathbf{p}} & \text{generation limits} \\ & \mathbf{1}^{\top}(\mathbf{p} + \widehat{\mathbf{w}} - \mathbf{d}) = \mathbf{0} & : \boldsymbol{\lambda}_{b} & \text{power balance condition} \\ & |\mathbf{F}(\mathbf{p} + \widehat{\mathbf{w}} - \mathbf{d})| \leqslant \overline{\mathbf{f}} & : \boldsymbol{\lambda}_{\overline{\mathbf{f}}}, \boldsymbol{\lambda}_{\underline{\mathbf{f}}} & \text{power flow limits} \\ \end{array}$$

where  $\widehat{w}$  is the forecast of wind power generation

■ Goal: unveil wind power forecast model of the system operator ...

What information we would typically know in practice?

### Application: Unveiling ISO's wind power forecast model - I

Consider an optimal power flow problem:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \underset{p}{\text{minimize}} & \mathbf{p}^{\top}\mathbf{C}\mathbf{p} + \mathbf{c}^{\top}\mathbf{p} & \text{generator dispatch cost} \\ \text{subject to} & \underline{\mathbf{p}} \leqslant \mathbf{p} \leqslant \overline{\mathbf{p}} & \text{generation limits} \\ & \mathbf{1}^{\top}(\mathbf{p} + \widehat{\mathbf{w}} - \mathbf{d}) = \mathbf{0} & : \boldsymbol{\lambda}_{b} & \text{power balance condition} \\ & |\mathbf{F}(\mathbf{p} + \widehat{\mathbf{w}} - \mathbf{d})| \leqslant \overline{\mathbf{f}} & : \boldsymbol{\lambda}_{\overline{\mathbf{f}}}, \boldsymbol{\lambda}_{\underline{\mathbf{f}}} & \text{power flow limits} \\ \end{array}$$

where  $\widehat{\mathbf{w}}$  is the forecast of wind power generation

■ Goal: unveil wind power forecast model of the system operator ...

- What information we would typically know in practice?
- $\blacksquare$  We observe public weather data  $\varphi$  and locational marginal prices  $\pi$

$$\pi = oldsymbol{\lambda}_b \cdot oldsymbol{1} - oldsymbol{\mathsf{F}}^ op (oldsymbol{\lambda}_{\overline{\mathsf{f}}} - oldsymbol{\lambda}_{\overline{\mathsf{f}}})$$

## Application: Unveiling ISO's wind power forecast model - I

Consider an optimal power flow problem:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \underset{p}{\text{minimize}} & \mathbf{p}^{\top}\mathbf{C}\mathbf{p} + \mathbf{c}^{\top}\mathbf{p} & \text{generator dispatch cost} \\ \text{subject to} & \underline{\mathbf{p}} \leqslant \mathbf{p} \leqslant \overline{\mathbf{p}} & \text{generation limits} \\ & \mathbf{1}^{\top}(\mathbf{p} + \widehat{\mathbf{w}} - \mathbf{d}) = \mathbf{0} & : \lambda_b & \text{power balance condition} \\ & |\mathbf{F}(\mathbf{p} + \widehat{\mathbf{w}} - \mathbf{d})| \leqslant \overline{\mathbf{f}} & : \lambda_{\overline{\mathbf{f}}}, \lambda_{\underline{\mathbf{f}}} & \text{power flow limits} \\ \end{array}$$

where  $\widehat{\mathbf{w}}$  is the forecast of wind power generation

■ Goal: unveil wind power forecast model of the system operator ...

- What information we would typically know in practice?
- $\blacksquare$  We observe public weather data arphi and locational marginal prices  $\pi$

$$\pi = oldsymbol{\lambda}_b \cdot oldsymbol{1} - oldsymbol{\mathsf{F}}^ op (oldsymbol{\lambda}_{\overline{\mathsf{f}}} - oldsymbol{\lambda}_{\overline{\mathsf{f}}})$$

■ Goal (cont'd): ... using historical LMPs and weather features

## Application: Unveiling ISO's wind power forecast model - II

■ Reformulate the problem in the FO form from above and take the dual

$$\begin{array}{ll} \underset{p}{\text{minimize}} & \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{p}^{\top} \mathbf{C} \mathbf{p} + \mathbf{c}^{\top} \mathbf{p} & \underset{\lambda}{\text{maximize}} & \mathbf{q}(\widehat{\mathbf{w}})^{\top} \lambda - \lambda^{\top} \mathbf{Q} \lambda \\ \\ \text{subject to} & \mathbf{A} \mathbf{p} \geqslant \mathbf{b}(\widehat{\mathbf{w}}) & : \lambda & \text{subject to} & \lambda \geqslant \mathbf{0} \\ \\ & \text{primal FO problem} & \text{dual FO problem} \\ \\ \text{where } \mathbf{q}(\widehat{\mathbf{w}}) = \mathbf{A} \mathbf{C}^{-1} \mathbf{c} + \mathbf{b}(\widehat{\mathbf{w}}) \text{ and } \mathbf{Q} = \mathbf{A} \mathbf{C}^{-1} \mathbf{A} \end{array}$$

### Application: Unveiling ISO's wind power forecast model - II

Reformulate the problem in the FO form from above and take the dual

$$\begin{array}{ll} \underset{p}{\text{minimize}} & \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{p}^{\top} \mathbf{C} \mathbf{p} + \mathbf{c}^{\top} \mathbf{p} & \underset{\lambda}{\text{maximize}} & \mathbf{q}(\widehat{\mathbf{w}})^{\top} \lambda - \lambda^{\top} \mathbf{Q} \lambda \\ \\ \text{subject to} & \mathbf{A} \mathbf{p} \geqslant \mathbf{b}(\widehat{\mathbf{w}}) & : \lambda & \text{subject to} & \lambda \geqslant \mathbf{0} \\ \\ \textbf{primal FO problem} & \textbf{dual FO problem} \\ \\ \text{where } \mathbf{q}(\widehat{\mathbf{w}}) = \mathbf{A} \mathbf{C}^{-1} \mathbf{c} + \mathbf{b}(\widehat{\mathbf{w}}) \text{ and } \mathbf{Q} = \mathbf{A} \mathbf{C}^{-1} \mathbf{A} \\ \end{array}$$

We use a ReLU neural network to map features into predictions



### Application: Unveiling ISO's wind power forecast model - III



IEEE 118-bus system

- One wind farm at bus 39
- 1,000 scenarios with 118 LMPs, wind speed, direction, and peach blade angle
- Stochastic GD with 1,000 epochs

### Application: Unveiling ISO's wind power forecast model - III



IEEE 118-bus system

- One wind farm at bus 39
- 1,000 scenarios with 118 LMPs, wind speed, direction, and peach blade angle
- Stochastic GD with 1,000 epochs



#### Resources

- Chan, T. C., Mahmood, R., & Zhu, I. Y. (2025). Inverse optimization: Theory and applications. Operations Research, 73(2), 1046-1074. [must read]
- Mitridati, L., & Pinson, P. (2017). A Bayesian inference approach to unveil supply curves in electricity markets. IEEE Transactions on Power Systems, 33(3), 2610-2620.
- Birge, J. R., Hortaçsu, A., & Pavlin, J. M. (2017). Inverse optimization for the recovery of market structure from market outcomes: An application to the MISO electricity market. Operations Research, 65(4), 837-855.